

COMPARATIVE STUDY OF STUDENTS GRADUATED FROM PUBLIC AND PRIVATE COLLEGES IN SINDH

Naushad Ali Bhutto

Department of Agricultural Economics, Sindh Agriculture University Tandojam

Sarmad Veesar

Department of Agricultural Economics, Sindh Agriculture University Tandojam

Attaullah Veesar

Department of Agricultural Economics, Sindh Agriculture University Tandojam

Abdullah Magsi

Department of English, Sindh Madressatul Islam University, Karachi

*Corresponding author: magsiabdullah23@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The present study was conducted to make a comparative evaluation between the role of the private and public sector in promoting excellent education in Sindh province of Pakistan. Data was collected with the help of google questionnaire from students at Sindh agriculture university Tandojam. MS Excel was used to analyze the data. The results show that average family members in public institute was greater than private institute and parents are less educated and less designation; therefore, upon their income they send their kids to the public institutes. The results also highlighted the factors that are involved in higher performance of students in private institutes as compared to that of students in public institutes, as their grades were higher. Because, students of public institution were irregular, and involved in political activities, therefore, they had little focus on their studies. It is recommended that government should bound the public sector institutes to provide same level of infrastructure and modern technical aids as provided at private institutes.

Keywords: Government College, Private Education, Sindh, Pakistan.

1. INTRODUCTION

Educational institutions have shaped the world while producing quality professionals, teachers, political leaders, social and religious scholars, and skilled labor, who are serving the society for its resource development (Mustard, 1998). Education can be acquired formally and informally. Formal educational process begins from curriculum development to final assessment, for example, admission, teaching and learning objectives. In parallel, the education output is the consequences of the process (Memon, 2007). Shah (2003) has disclosed that in Sindh, the education system has several stages, i.e., pre-primary, primary, middle, secondary, higher secondary, and professional and/or technical education. Apart from that there is also religious education system named as madrassah.

The start of private sector's education was good, but then it became a business later on. One educational institute or academy turned into business sector. In private sector's education the owner of private educational institutes is mostly business minded people, so they compromise on each and everything. They don't hire high qualified teacher because he can't give the proper salary to that high qualified man, so he hires low qualified. Inexperienced man on less salary and that man are immature, untrained and inexperienced and having no qualified degree, the syllabus is good of private sector but useless because the teacher is not able to teach that syllabus, the private education the qualified teacher makes and builds up the personality of student and that teacher becomes a role model and inspiring for the students but high qualified teachers are not appointed in private sector, the low qualified teacher in private sector damages the entire personality of the students, so in private sector there is only spoon feeding now.

Awan and Zia (2015) have investigated that parents prefer private schools instead of government schools. The Government of Sindh is trying to universalize the school education by providing free education along with several schemes like, distribution of free reading materials (books), and provide stipends to girls for encouraging female education in the province. Ahmed et al. (2015) have exposed that schools and colleges located at underdeveloped regions encourage more students for bring more children to the schools. Despite of all, there is a remarkable competition between public sector and private sector schooling system in the province. It is commonly accepted that private schools and colleges provide quality education. As described by Rothschild and White (1995), the job market with new skill requirements affects the higher education system, which is main factor for encouraging private sector to invest in this sector. The main difference between private sector's education and public sector education is the syllabus, private sector's is based and made up of on modern perspectives, which become revised with the passage of time, new scientific theories, researches and trends, are introduced in that syllabus, by reading that syllabus the modern student become update and self-creative. While public sector's syllabus is less compatible with current job market. Thus, main difference between students of public sector and private sector is that the students of public sector are not updated from new trends, theories, scientific research, etc (Haque et al. 2022).

In fact, there is little literature is available on private and public university system as well as in their attraction. Therefore, this study is designed to investigate difference between two higher education systems prevailing in the province. Thus, specific objectives of our study were (i) to ascertain what inference makes significant difference between public and private education system; and (ii) to compare student's perspective about their choices towards public and private colleges prior to coming the universities.

2. Methodology

Research survey was designed to measure the effectiveness of performance of public and private sector colleges in Sindh province regarding their quality assurance. In this connection students of Sindh Agriculture University Tandojam were interviewed through stratified sampling technique. Twenty students from each of the five faculties were selected as a sample; from which equal number of students were interviewed, who have studied in private and public colleges, prior to joining the university.

However, assessment was generally quantitative and qualitative in nature supported by sample comprised over hundred respondents. Thus, the primary data were collected through a pre-tested questionnaire. The questions were mainly comprised over the socioeconomic conditions of their parents, their choices of the selecting colleges, environment of their institutes, their grades, etc. Once the data was gathered, it was arranged and organized and placed in coding system by using spread sheet (MS Excel), further the data were tabulated summarized and analyzed statistically.

3. Results and discussion

The findings are comprised over socioeconomic characteristics of the respondents, and selection of public and/or private institutes for intermediate education. The result shows that average family member of private students are 5.7 and 7.2 percent and average age of students in private education institution is 21.3 and 21.8 percent age of public students. Majority of the students who studied in private institutions belongs to elite class or landlord, and those students who belongs to middle class family, have studies in public institutes.

3.1. Socioeconomic conditions of the respondents

Table 1: Descriptive statistics of the respondents

Description		Private	Public
Average family member (numbers)		5.7	7.2
Average age of students (numbers)		21.3	21.8
Average education of their parents (years)		12.8	5.2
Family status (%)	Elite/Landlord	72	28
	Government servant	45	55
	Farmer	11	89
	Shopkeeper	6	94
	Doctor	100	0
Interest for selection college (majority)		Parents	Own
Average marks in intermediate program (%)		63.2	61.7

Results further show that the parents of the students graduated from private colleges were at least intermediate, where it was the choice of parents to send their kids to private colleges. On the other hands, parents of the student who attended public colleges were about primary education, where it was students' choice to select the college. This may be due to parent were unaware about higher education system. Siddiqui (2000) have also argued that there is signification difference between the opinions of private universities students of parents with regards to the quality of education. Above table highlights that student graduated from private colleges has higher grades then public colleges, which might be impact of educational environment. It is commonly assumed that private colleges often offer better forms of education, public colleges are often less able to respond to financial crisis and time to pass-out is often longer for public institution, etc. (Awan and Zia, 2015).

Haque et al. (2022) have highlighted that the public institutions with limited finance are depending on grants loans to fulfil their requirements, while private institutes charge huge tuition fee in this regard. For state institutions, limited finance lead to a reduced ability to offer merit scholarships, a reduction in the size of the institution building, larger classes, layoffs and the cutting of programs (World Bank, 2000).

3.2 Parents' choice regarding public and private college selection

In this section we have investigated that what are the main factors which are appealing parents to decide for whether public or private colleges for their children, in order to have a better future.

Table 2: Parents' choices of colleges selection for their Children

Description	Public	Private
Quality of education	×	✓
Location (nearest)	✓	×
Facilities	×	✓
Educational environment	×	✓
Quality of good teacher	×	✓
Fee's structure	✓	×
University standard	×	✓

Table-2 emphasis over the results regarding parents' preferences why they are making decisions towards institution selection for their children. Therefore, they prefer the public colleges for their children mostly choose on the base of location and fees structure, because they cannot afford the transport and hostel expenses and also highly tuition fees etc., so that they prefer public collages but other side they are not satisfy the environment of public institution as compared to private institution.

Table 3: Students opinion on public and private colleges' education environment

Description	Private	Public
Was number of students per class satisfactory?	4.4	3.2
Were you satisfied from fee charged by your institute?	1.7	3.7
Were Teacher highly qualified?	3.6	2.1
Was behavior of teachers with students good?	4.1	2.8
Were the classes equipped with Hi-tech?	4.8	2.9
Have you observed boycott of classes?	1.4	4.6
How do you rank facilities at your colleges/institutes?	4.2	3.1
How was over all environment of your institute?	4.5	3.9

Data was measured in Like type psychometric scale from 1 to 5, (one means poor and 2 means fairs, 3 means fair, 4 means good, 5 means excellent). Above table shows the performance measurement was between public and private colleges, as private

institutions try to provide suitable learning environment along with required facilities, while public sector institutes have well trained teachers. It was also observed that there was less attendance in public colleges, less facilities in the classrooms, huge number of students per class, and insufficient number teachers. Shaheen (2008) has found that private institutes provide better facilities as compared to government institutes. Moreover, he has also found that behavior teachers in private institutes better, while in public sector the teachers show anger and rudeness in nature. Results also show that private college students are more satisfied regarding cooperation of their teachers, teaching methods, and with their encouragement through competition. Similarly, Shabbir et al. (2014) have found that the public college students are not satisfied from their schooling, and teachers behavior; they always try to change the schools and/or colleges in their study area.

Most of the respondents have disclosed some facts about their college education environment that the political involvement affects education severely, i.e., fights, propaganda, shouting in classes, wasting time, etc. are commonly observed. It was also observed that few parents send their kids to private colleges just due to no political environment, they were afraid that their kids may not get indulged in political activities, even though it was hard for them to afford huge tuition fee of their child. Similarly, we examined that in public institution have less fees than private one and which is afforded by their parents easily because mostly lower-class peoples send their kids to public colleges. Literature suggests that the concept of private sector's education in Pakistan was good, but thereafter it became a business (Haque et al., 2022; Awan and Zai, 2015; Shabbir et al. 2014; Shaheen 2008).

4. Conclusion and recommendations

It is concluded that that private institutes are providing better educational environment as compared to public institutes. Results further show that students who were graduated from private colleges have higher grades. The private institution consist great equipment's used in their institute, and they live in great environment and a smaller number of students in classroom and their teacher are very comparative and their behavior were good with students. Where in public institution their equipment's and the infrastructure were just satisfactory. Elite class families and doctors have preferred to send their kids to private schools/colleges instead of free Government institutes, because of the facilities and secure educational environment. While others could not afford huge tuition fee, transportation, and accommodation costs; thus, they sent their kids to public colleges. That's why they compromise on the quality of education.

Thus, on the basis of above conclusions, it is recommended that there is need to devise a of check and balance mechanism in public sector colleges to improve their performance. Due to higher enrollment of student in public sector then private sector institutes, it is suggested to establish more schools in the public sector. Moreover, the school curriculum should be updated according to the market needs of the society and it should be revised regularly. Where, Government should also monitor the working of private institution and formulate specific rules and regulation to create harmony in their curriculum and required infrastructure; and private sector institutes should not be allowed just for commercializing the education in the province.

REFERENCES

- Ahmed, G., Munshi, P. and Jumani, N.B. 2015. Impact of in-Service Teacher Training at Elementary Level in Sindh Province. *The Sindh University Journal of Education*, 44(2), 149-164.
- Awan A.G. and Zia, A. 2015. Comparative Analysis of Public and Private Educational Institutions: A case study of District Vehari-Pakistan. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 6(16): 122-130.
- Haque, A., Mansoor, S., Malik, F., Ahmed, J. and Haque, Z. 2022. Comparison of Quality of Life of Medical Students in Annual and Modular System in Public Sector Medical Colleges in Karachi, Pakistan. *International Journal of Medical Students*, 10(3): 258-263.
- Memon, G.R. 2007. Education in Pakistan: The key issues, problems and the New Challenge. Department of Education, University of Karachi. *Journal of Management and Social Sciences*, 3(1): 47-55.
- Mustard, F. 1998. *The Nurturing of creativity: The role of higher education*. Oxford University Press. Karachi.
- Rothschild, M. and White, L. 1995. The Analytics of the Pricing of Higher Education and Other Services in which Customers are Inputs. *Journal of Political Economy*. 103.
- Shabbir, M., Wei, W., Fu, Y.G., Chong, R., Marwat, M.A., Nabi, G. and Ahmed, B. 2014. A Comparative Study of Public Versus Private Primary Schools, an Evidence from Azad Kashmir (Pakistan Administrative Kashmir). *Journal of Education and Practices*, 5(9): 154-168.
- Shah, D. 2003. Seminar on Decentralization Policies and Strategies in Education (Presented at UNESCO, held at Buenos Aires, Argentina). From 30th June to 3rd July, 2003.
- Shaheen, R. 2008. A Comparative Study of Aggressive Behavior of Public and Private School Teachers in Lahore. Unpublished Thesis of Master in Education. Division of Education, University of Education, Lahore.
- Siddique, S. 2000. Making Higher Education Meaningful. *Pakistan Journal of Education*, 17 (2): 31-33.
- World Bank. 2000. Higher Education in developing countries: Peril and Promise. UNESCO Task Force Report. New York, World Bank.